

MINUTES

NATIONAL COMMISSION ON RECOGNITION OF DENTAL SPECIALTIES AND CERTIFYING BOARDS VIDEO CONFERENCE CALL

April 26-27, 2021

Call to Order: Dr. Alan Friedel, chair, called a regular meeting of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards to order on Monday, April 26, 2021 at 1:01 pm central daylight standard time via video conference call.

Roll Call: Dr. Wayne Aldredge, Dr. Joseph Battaglia, Dr. James Benz, Dr. Renee Broughten, Dr. Mara-Catey-Williams, Dr. Jeffrey Chaffin, Dr. Ralph Cooley, Dr. Alan Felsenfeld, Dr. Alan Friedel (chair), Dr. Steven Ganzberg, Dr. Gayle Glenn, Dr. David Halpern, Dr. Michael Huber, Dr. William Johnson, Dr. Jonathan Knapp, Dr. Maureen Lang, Dr. Brian McAllister, Dr. Edward Moody, Dr. Susan Muller, Dr. Charles Norman, Dr. Prabu Raman, Dr. Aruna Ramesh and Dr. Brenda Young were present. Dr. Anthony Carroccia and Dr. Frank Tuminelli (vice-chair) were unable to participate in the meeting.

Trustee Liaison: Dr. Michael Medovic, Sixth District Trustee, American Dental Association (ADA).

Commission Staff: Ms. Cathy Baumann, director; Mr. Nicholas Salerno, manager.

ADA Staff (for all or portions of the meeting): Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, ADA Senior Associate General Counsel and Dr. Anthony Ziebert, senior vice-president, Education and Professional Affairs.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopted the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest: Dr. Friedel directed the Commission's attention to the National Commission's Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Commission members disclosed the following affiliations during the course of the meeting:

- Dr. Michael Huber-Diplomate, American Board of Oral Medicine
- Dr. Maureen Lang- Diplomate, American Board of Orofacial Pain

Fiduciary Responsibility and Reminder of Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment: Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, ADA Senior Associate General Counsel, reminded the Commissioners of their fiduciary responsibilities to the National Commission. The Commissioners were also reminded of the Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment.

Commission Business

Mail Ballots Since Last Commission Meeting:

- September 29, 2020 Commission Meeting Minutes

Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review:

- Informational Report Related to Progress on National Commission 2020-2025 Strategic Plan

Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review:

Informational Report on Progress on the National Commission's 2020-2025 Strategic Plan: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards was provided with an informational report on progress that has been made on the National Commission's 2020-2025 Strategic Plan.

In March 2020, the National Commission adopted its 2020-2025 Strategic Plan. The Board of Commissioners noted that since adoption of the Strategic Plan in March 2020, significant progress has been made. The Board of commissioners further noted that an editorial revision was made to the 2020-2025 Strategic Plan to remove any language related to the specific software currently in use, and replace it with a generic reference to "electronic management software system."

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to National Commission's Policy on Integrity and Applications for Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards was provided with an informational report related to the Strategic Planning and Policy Review Committees support of proposed revisions recommended by the ad hoc Committee on Code of Conduct and Professionalism to the National Commission's Policy on Integrity and the Applications for Recognition. (See section of minutes related to the Report of the ad hoc Committee on Code of Conduct and Professionalism)

The Board of Commissioners noted that the Strategic Planning and Policy Review Committee reviewed the December 9, 2020 minutes of the ad hoc Committee on Code of Conduct and Professionalism, including the proposed revisions to the Policy on Integrity and the Applications for Recognition and concurred with the proposed revisions.

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

Consideration of Proposed Revised Policy Related to the Review Committees and Review Committee Meetings of the National Commission: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed revised policy related to Review Committees and Review Committee Meetings.

In September 2020, the Board of Commissioners discussed that the increase in the number of Commissioners, due to the recognition of three (3) additional specialties, has brought the total number of Commissioners to 25. Given this increase, there are enough Commissioners to fill all of the committee positions, including replacement of the consultants/external committee members that serve on the two (2) Review Committees. The Board of Commissioners charged the Strategic Planning and Policy Review Committee with developing policy that: (1) increases the number of commissioners on the Review Committees from four to six; (2) sunsets the two (2) consultants/external committee members; and (3) retains the appointment of the National Commission's public member for a total of seven (7) committee members. Further, the Board of Commissioners requested a provision in the policy to allow for the use of external non-voting subject matter experts, if the Review Committee determines outside expertise is required.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that proposed draft policy meets the expectations that were outlined in September 2020. The Board of Commissioners noted that the terms of the current consultants/external committee members expire at the close of the American Dental Association (ADA) House of Delegates meeting in October 2021; therefore, the policy will become effective at the close of the 2021 ADA House of Delegates meeting.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised policy related to the Review Committee and Review Committee Meetings effective at the close of the 2021 ADA House of Delegates meeting.

Consideration of Proposed Policy on Voluntary Discontinuance of Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed policy related to the voluntary discontinuance of recognition from a recognized dental specialty sponsoring organization and/or certifying board.

In March 2020, the Board of Commissioners adopted policy related to the withdrawal of recognition by the National Commission, but did not consider policy related to the voluntary discontinuance of recognition by an organization recognized by the National Commission.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that voluntary discontinuance of recognition by a recognized sponsoring organization has an impact on the composition of the Board of Commissioners as outlined in Article II. Board of Commissioners. Section 2. Composition of the National Commission *Rules* which requires an equal number of general dentist members as recognized specialty members. The Board of Commissioners further discussed the provision in the proposed policy regarding the effective date of voluntary discontinuance of recognition at the close of the ADA House of Delegates meeting in the ensuing year and the provision for early notification to the American Dental Association (ADA) Board of Trustees. By having the discontinuance become effective at the end of the ADA House of Delegates meeting, the ADA Board of Trustees has the option to retire one (1) general dentist Commissioner early or appoint one (1) less general dentist Commissioner to the National Commission.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the policy related Voluntary Discontinuance of Recognition.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to the National Commission Rules Based on Adoption of Policy on Voluntary Discontinuance of Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed revision of Article II. Board of Commissioners. Section 2. Composition in the *Rules* of the National Commission to address the withdrawal and/or voluntary discontinuance of recognition.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that based on the previous adoption of the Policies on Withdrawal of Recognition and Voluntary Discontinuance of Recognition, Article II. Board of Commissioners. Section 2. Composition in the *Rules* should be revised to ensure consistency between the *Rules* and previously adopted policies.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised *Rules*, specifically Article II. Board of Commissioners. Section 2. Composition.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Policy and Procedure Manual of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed revisions to the National Commission Policy and Procedure Manual.

As part of the National Commission's 2020-2025 Strategic Plan, the Board of Commissioners adopted Goal 3. Assessment Process Goal: Improve National Commission Processes, Objective 1. Annual Review of National Commission's Policy and Procedure Manual, Action/Metric 1: Development of rotating schedule to review a set number of policies for potential revisions on an annual basis. In September 2020, the Board of Commissioners adopted a three (3) year cycle to review the entire Policy and Procedure Manual. Given that the Policy and Procedure Manual contains six (6) sections, this equates to two (2) sections per year, with Section I: Introduction and General Information and Section II: Board of Commissioners and Review Committees being reviewed in 2021.

Purpose of this Manual

The revision expands language related to potential applicants for specialty recognition and the National Commission's communities of interest.

History and Authority of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards

The revision clarifies the reason for the establishment of the National Commission.

National Commission and Commission Meetings

The revision adds language related to the recognized specialty sponsoring organization and certifying boards.

National Commission Standing Committees

The revision adds the Communication and Technology Committee to the list of Standing Committees and adds to the charges/duties of the Strategic Planning and Policy Review Committee to review the Policy and Procedure Manual in its entirety over a three (3) year period and review progress on the National Commission's Strategic Plan on an annual basis.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised policies presented in Section 1 and Section 2 of the National Commission's Policy and Procedure Manual.

New Business

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Policy on Payment of Annual Fees by the Recognized Specialty Sponsoring Organizations: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed revisions to the National Commission's Policy on Payment of Annual Fees by the Recognized Specialty Sponsoring Organizations.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the current policy is not accurate based on the shared services agreement that was executed between the National Commission and the American Dental Association (ADA) in March 2020. Based on the shared services agreement, direct and indirect expenses for the National Commission are now evenly split between the ADA and recognized specialties.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised policy on Payment of Annual Fees by the Recognized Specialty Sponsoring Organizations.

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance:

Consideration of 2021 Revised Forecast Budget and 2022 Preliminary Draft Budget: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the 2021 revised forecast budget and the 2022 preliminary draft budget.

2021 Proposed Revised Forecast Budget

In March 2020, the Board of Commissioners adopted the National Commission's 2021 preliminary draft budget. Based on the 2021 budget, the recognized dental specialty sponsoring organization contribution was to be \$10,063 for each organization.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the proposed 2021 revised forecast budget reflects a \$21,966 decrease in expenses, as the National Commission is conducting a virtual meeting in 2021 due to pandemic meeting-size restrictions in place for the City of Chicago. The expense savings would be evenly split by the specialty sponsoring organizations and American Dental Association (ADA). The revenue and expense changes result in a decrease in the contribution of the recognized dental specialty sponsoring organizations to \$9,137 per specialty sponsoring organization for 2021.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the 2021 revised forecast budget.

2022 Preliminary Draft Budget

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the 2022 preliminary budget proposes an overall increase in direct and indirect expenses from \$241,255 (original 2021 budget) to \$259,632. The total fee allocated to the recognized dental specialty sponsoring organizations (\$129,816) is matched by the ADA. The 2022 preliminary budget proposes a \$755 increase from the original 2021 annual fees (\$10,062) to \$10,818. The Board of Commissioners discussed that the 2022 preliminary budget accurately reflects expenses related to conducting the National Commission's annual meeting and the increase to 25 Commissioners.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the 2022 preliminary budget.

Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Recognition: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Recognition:

Consideration of 2021 National Commission Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice and Recognition Statuses of the Recognized Specialty Sponsoring Organizations:

The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the dental specialty sponsoring organization's responses to the *2021 Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice*, the proposed revised definition for the specialty of endodontics, the final recognition statuses for each of the recognized sponsoring organizations and the final report to be published by the National Commission.

The Board of Commissioners noted that in the National Commission's Policy on Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education Practice, if a new specialty is recognized in the year that the Periodic Review is being conducted, the sponsoring organization will not be required to complete the Periodic Review in that year. Therefore, as oral medicine and orofacial were granted specialty recognition in 2020, when the review was being conducted, these sponsoring organizations did not participate in the Periodic Review.

The Board of Commissioners considered the responses submitted by the following recognized specialty sponsoring organizations for the *2021 Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice*. Based on review of the documentation the Board of Commissioners took the following actions:

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Academy of Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Academy of Pediatric Dentistry the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Academy of Periodontology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Association of Endodontists the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Association of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Association of Orthodontists the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Association of Public Health Dentistry the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American College of Prosthodontists the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Society of Dentist Anesthesiologists the continued status of Recognition.

Proposed Definition Change for Endodontics

The Board of Commissioners discussed the proposed definition change for the specialty of endodontics submitted by the American Association of Endodontists:

Endodontics: Endodontics is the dental specialty which is concerned with the morphology, biology, physiology, pathology and regeneration of the human dental pulp and periradicular tissues. Its study and practice encompass the basic and clinical sciences including biology of the normal pulp, the etiology, diagnosis, prevention and treatment of diseases and injuries of the pulp and associated periradicular conditions.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised definition for the specialty of endodontics.

2021 Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice Final Report

The Board of Commissioners discussed the *2021 Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice* final report and determined the report was accurate.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the *2021 Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice* final report.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the National Commission Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice Template: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed revisions to the Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice template.

Purpose of the Review

The revision removes language related to the history of the Periodic Review prior to the establishment of the National Commission.

Instructions to the Dental Sponsoring Organizations

The revision includes language related to the recognized certifying boards and the American Dental Association's (ADA) Health Policy Institute.

Policy on Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice

The revision provides greater clarification and expand language to include all of the recognition statuses.

Section I: General Information and Demographic Data

The revision clarifies submission expectations related to history of the specialty, the six (6) *Requirements for Recognition*, the strategic plan, and a revision to the Total Number of Specialists in Membership Categories chart to identify members who are non-specialists.

Membership/Gender and Ethnicity Chart

The revision includes the addition an unknown category to the gender section.

Certification and Examination Data Chart and Board Eligibility Requirements Chart

The revision clarifies that the data provided in the charts was from the sponsoring organizations respective certifying board.

Section II: Major Research Changes and Technology Initiatives

The revision removes the word “Changes” in the title of the section and replace it with “Initiatives”.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revisions to the Periodic Review of Dental Specialty Education and Practice template.

Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Certifying Board Recognition: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Certifying Board Recognition:

Consideration of Request by the American Board of Oral Medicine to be Recognized as the National Certifying Boards for Oral Medicine: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the request and application submitted by the American Board of Oral Medicine (ABOM) to recognized as the national certifying board for oral medicine. Based on a previously cited disclosure, Dr. Michael Huber participated in the discussion; however, he was recused from voting.

The Board of Commissioners were provided with an overview of the Review Committees review process of the application and the rationale behind the committee’s recommendation that ABOM be recognized as the national certifying board for oral medicine. The National Commission voted via electronic ballot on each of the *Requirements for Recognition of National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists* and the application achieved the necessary 2/3rds majority to recognize the ABOM as the national certifying board for oral medicine.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Oral Medicine request to be recognized as the national certifying board for oral medicine.

Informational Update on American Board of Orofacial Pain Application for Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards was provided with an informational report on the status of the American Board of Orofacial Pain (ABOP) application for recognition.

The Board of Commissioners noted that the ABOP submitted their request and application for recognition to be the recognized national certifying board for orofacial pain in July 2020; however, the application was not considered complete until several identified deficiencies were corrected in December 2020. Therefore, the timeline for application consideration has been delayed by five months and the application is currently out for the mandatory 60-day comment period to the communities of interest, which ends at 5:00pm central standard time on May 3, 2021.

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

Consideration of 2021 National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the certifying board responses to the *2021 National Commission Annual Report of the Recognized Certifying Boards* and the final recognition statuses for each of the recognized certifying boards.

The Board of Commissioners noted that overall the reports submitted by the recognized certifying boards were more accurate and complete than in previous years and the statistical data remained relatively consistent.

The Board of Commissioners considered the responses submitted by the following recognized specialty certifying boards for the for the *2021 Annual Report of the Recognized Certifying Boards*. Based on review of the documentation the Board of Commissioners took the following actions:

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Dental Public Health the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Endodontics the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Orthodontics the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Pediatric Dentistry the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Periodontology the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Board of Prosthodontics the continued status of Recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards grants the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology the continued status of Recognition.

2021 Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards Final Report

The Board of Commissioners discussed the *2021 Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards* and determined the report was accurate.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the *2021 Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards* final report.

Report of the Communication and Technology Committee: Below is the action taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Communication and Technology Committee:

Consideration of Communication Tools and Strategies for the National Commission: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered the proposed communication tools and strategies for the National Commission.

In March 2020, as part of the 2020-2025 Strategic Plan, the Board of Commissioners established the Communication and Technology Committee to develop and implement a Communication Plan to aid in educating the public/communities of interest in the role of the National Commission, improve

communication with the communities of interest, to investigate and make a recommendation to the Board of Commissioners on the development and costs related to technology upgrades and assist Commission staff develop revised content for the National Commission's website.

The Board of Commissioners noted that one of the major communication strategies focuses on the development of a revised website for the National Commission that is user friendly, provides relevant information and contains content that is easy for the communities of interest and public to understand. The Board of Commissioners further noted the revised website includes a new section related to training and educational resources focusing on items of interest for the recognized sponsoring organizations and certifying boards, organizations that are considering specialty recognition and the communities of interest and public.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the National Commission Communication Plan.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition: Below is the action taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition:

Informational Discussion Related to the Progress of the Ad Hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards had an informational discussion related to the progress of the ad hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition.

While the ad hoc Committee developed draft *Requirements for Recognition for Subspecialties*, and recommended the National Commission adopt these requirements, several Commissioners expressed concern that the adoption of the subspecialty requirements was premature and further investigation and discussion is required on whether there is a need for subspecialty recognition in dentistry. In particular, broader input from all the communities of interest is required on the need for subspecialty recognition.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards referred the topic of subspecialty recognition to the National Commission's Strategic Planning and Policy Review Committee for further investigation.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Code of Conduct and Professionalism: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards related to the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Code on Conduct and Professionalism:

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the National Commission's Policy on Integrity and the Applications for Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards considered proposed revisions to the Policy on Integrity and both the sponsoring organization and certifying board applications for recognition.

In March 2020, the Board of Commissioners discussed concerns related to the unprofessional behavior of individuals and organizations that occurred during the application for recognition process. As part of the 2020-2025 strategic plan, the Board of Commissioners directed that an ad hoc committee be created to consider the possible development of a Code of Conduct and Professionalism for Commissioners, individuals and organizations that interact with the National Commission. Further, in March 2020, the National Commission adopted a Policy on Integrity, revised the Policy on Third Party Comments to contain language that the National Commission will only accept public comments that pertain to an applicant's compliance with the *Requirements for Recognition* and that any comment that includes Protected Health Information (PHI) and/or Personally Identifiable Information (PII); and violates the American Dental Association's (ADA) Principles of Ethics and Code of Professional Conduct; and/or contains unprofessional remarks will be disregarded.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the current Policy on Integrity primarily speaks to organizational and not individual behavior and the policy should be expanded to contain language

related to individual behavior. The Board of Commissioners discussed that language should be added to the Applicant Instructions section of the Applications for Recognition which informs applicants that if the application contains information that is not factual and relevant and/or contains disparaging remarks about other organizations, the application will be returned to the applicant with the request to revise and resubmit the application. The Board of Commissioners further discussed that the revised Policy on Integrity and the American Dental Association (ADAA) Professional Conduct Policy should be added to the sponsoring organization and certifying board Application for Recognition with language informing the applicant that it is the National Commissions expectation that all of these policies will be followed throughout the application process.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised Policy on Integrity.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised sponsoring organization application for recognition.

Further, the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adopts the revised certifying board application for recognition.

Election of Vice-Chair of the Commission: In accordance with the *Rules* of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards, the Board of Commissioners elects a Vice-Chair who is active, life or retired member of the American Dental Association.

Commission Action: The National Commission elects Dr. Brian McAllister to serve as its Vice Chair for 2021-2022.

Discussion Related to National Commission Composition after 2024 Class of Commissioners

Complete Term: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards discussed concerns related to the composition of the National Commission after the 2024 class of Commissioners complete their term in October 2024.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that over the past three (3) years, with the recognition of three (3) new specialties and the addition of three general dentist members, nine (9) of the 25 Commissioners terms will end at the close of the 2024 American Dental Association (ADA) House of Delegates meeting, which equates to a turnover of almost half of the Board Commissioners every four (4) years.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that while the National Commission does not have any recourse to the to change the term lengths, it may be helpful to have the organizations that are appointing Commissioners whose terms that will start after the close of the ADA House of Delegates meeting in 2024, identify and appoint those individuals as “apprentice/red shirt, non-voting” Commissioners in 2023. The concept of having “apprentice/red-shirt” Commissioners would allow these Commissioners to be privy to National Commission business which would keep the National Commission functioning at a high level when their terms start. The Board of Commissioners further discussed that this topic should be addressed with the ADA Board of Trustees and the effected sponsoring organizations to ensure that making additional Commissioner appointments during those specific years is not encroaching on the appointment rights of the currently seated Board of Trustees and/or the recognized specialty sponsoring organizations leadership boards.

The Board of Commissioners determined that the National Commission’s Nomination Committee should develop possible short term and long term solutions with a report back to Board of Commissioners at its March 2022 meeting.

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

Discussion Related to Convening a Special Meeting to Consider the American Board of Orofacial Pain Application for Recognition: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards discussed the American Board of Orofacial Pain (ABOP) request to convene a special meeting in the summer of 2021 to consider the ABOP application for recognition.

The informational report on the status of the American Board of Orofacial Pain (ABOP) application for recognition provides the background for the Board of Commissioners discussion of the ABOP request to consider its application for recognition prior to the next regularly scheduled meeting of the National Commission in March 2022. As the ABOP application was not in order until December 2020, even though it was initially submitted in July 2020, the National Commission is well within the published timeline to consider the application at its scheduled March 2022 meeting. The Board of Commissioners further discussed that scheduling a special meeting of both the Review Committee and the National Commission would confer an undue administrative and financial burden on the National Commission, especially since the National Commission will render a decision within the 20-month window.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards affirms that it will consider the American Board of Orofacial Pain application for recognition at its next regularly scheduled meeting in March 2022.

Discussion Related to the Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards discussed the *Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists*.

The Board of Commissioners reviewed the political reason why the *Requirements for Recognition* remain under the purview of the ADA House of Delegates and Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL), while specialty recognition itself was delegated to the newly formed National Commission. Further, any revisions that the National Commission would like made to the *Requirements for Recognition* must be approved by CDEL before the House of Delegates will consider the revisions. If CDEL does not agree with the National Commission's request for revisions to the *Requirements for Recognition*, the request does not move forward and the National Commission has no recourse.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that when the National Commission was established, it was done so in good faith and done for the right reasons, however, the profession may not necessarily be well served if the National Commission identifies concerns with the *Requirements for Recognition* and has no recourse to address the concerns.

The Board of Commissioners discussed potential strategies on how to address their concerns, which included the National Commission chair addressing the ADA Board of Trustees and/or CDEL. The Board of Commissioners noted the best strategy would be to obtain support from CDEL to make a recommendation to the ADA Houses of Delegates to make *Bylaws* changes that give the National Commission ownership and authority over the *Requirements for Recognition*. The Board of Commissioners further discussed that it is the National Commission's goal to move the process forward and make a stronger Commission and ADA by removing any perceived conflicts of interest based on the fact that ADA House of Delegates and CDEL have sole authority over the *Requirements for Recognition*.

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

Reflective Discussion Related to the Evolution of the National Commission Since its Establishment and Possible Goal Setting: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards held a reflective discussion on the evolution of the National Commission since its establishment.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that based on the current *Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Boards for Dental Specialists* there are no more areas in dentistry that are eligible for specialty recognition; therefore, the National Commission's focus will be on oversight of the currently recognized dental specialty sponsoring organization and their respective certifying boards. The Board of Commissioners further discussed that the National Commission is currently in its fourth year of existence and that as with every new Commission, it has experienced growing pains; however, the National Commission has done an exceptional job of identifying problems/pitfalls and has swiftly taken action to correct and address all issues in a proper manner.

This report is informational; therefore, no action was required.

New Business

Discussion Related to Concerns in the Disparities in the Recertification/Certification Maintenance Processes of the Recognized Certifying Boards: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards discussed concerns in the disparities in the recertification/certification maintenance processes of the recognized certifying boards.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that during review of the Annual Reports of the Recognized Certifying Boards it became apparent that there are large discrepancies in the rigor of the recertification/certification maintenance processes of the recognized certifying boards. The Board of Commissioners discussed that all of the recognized certifying boards require varying levels of continuing education; however, some of the certifying boards also require recertification examinations.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that while each of the recognized certifying boards is autonomous and has sole purview over their processes, some specialties are more academic-based as compared to those specialties that are hospital-based. These hospital-based specialties may have certain recertification/certification maintenance required by the hospital; however, there is still concern over the varying levels of rigor in these requirements.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the best way for the National Commission to better understand these discrepancies would be to have the certifying boards explain their recertification/certification maintenance process and the rationale for the process.

Commission Action: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards directed staff and the Review Committee on Specialty Certifying Board Recognition to request information from the recognized certifying boards related to recertification/certification maintenance processes with a report back to the Board of Commissioners in 2022.

Future Meeting Dates: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards reviewed the meeting dates of the 2022, 2023 and 2024 meetings.

This report is informational in nature and no action was taken.

Adjournment: The National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards adjourned at 4:00 pm central daylight standard time, Tuesday, April 27, 2021.