

MINUTES

NATIONAL COMMISSION ON RECOGNITION OF DENTAL SPECIALTIES AND CERTIFYING BOARDS ADA HEADQUARTERS BUILDING CHICAGO

APRIL 15, 2024

Call to Order: Dr. Gayle Glenn, chair, called a regular meeting of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards (National Commission) to order on Monday, April 15, 2024 at 8:03 am central standard time in the Executive Board Room of the ADA Headquarters Building, Chicago.

Roll Call: Dr. K. Jean Beauchamp, Dr. Michele Beeler, Dr. Donald Clem, Dr. Kitrina Cordell, Dr. Alan Felsenfeld, Dr. Renee Fennell, Dr. David Halpern, Dr. Michael Mashni, Dr. Kathleen Murphy, Dr. Ned Murphy, Dr. Stephen Radack, Dr. Prabu Raman, Dr. Cynthia Sherwood, Dr. Ben Warner (vice-chair), Dr. Douglas Wyckoff and Dr. Brenda Young were present. Dr. Leonard Aste, Dr. Jeffrey Chaffin, Dr. Alan Gluskin, Dr. Michael Huber, Dr. Stephen Hudis, Dr. Maureen Lang, and Dr. Aruna Ramesh attended the meeting virtually. Dr. Julius Manz was unable to participate in the meeting.

Trustee Liaison: Dr. John Hisel, Eleventh District Trustee, American Dental Association (ADA).

Commission Guest: Dr. Andrew Kwasny, Strategic Planning Consultant, attended the meeting virtually.

Commission Staff: Ms. Catherine Baumann, director, National Commission and Mr. Nicholas Salerno, manager, Administrative Services, Education and Professional Affairs.

ADA Staff (for all or portions of the meeting): Ms. Christy Rothchild, ADA Senior Associate General Counsel.

Preliminary Business

Adoption of Agenda: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopted the agenda and authorized the chair to alter the order of agenda items as necessary to expedite business.

Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest: Dr. Glenn directed the Commission's attention to the National Commission Conflict of Interest Policy and reminded commissioners of their obligation to make disclosures as appropriate. Dr. Stephen Hudis disclosed his affiliation with the American College of Prosthodontists (ACP) as it relates to the ACP letter of support for the American Academy of Maxillofacial Prosthetics to apply for subspecialty designation.

Fiduciary Responsibility and Reminder of Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment: Ms. Christy Rothchild, ADA Senior Associate General Counsel, reminded the Commissioners of their fiduciary responsibilities to the National Commission. The Commissioners were also reminded of the Professional Conduct Policy and Prohibition Against Harassment.

Commission Business

Consent Calendar: The following reports were placed on the consent calendar and adopted:

Mail Ballots Since Last National Commission Meeting:

- April 24, 2023 National Commission Meeting Minutes
- July 24, 2023 National Commission Meeting Minutes
- March 14, 2024 National Commission Meeting Minutes

Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review:

- Informational Report Related to Progress on National Commission 2020-2025 Strategic Plan

Report of the Standing Committee on Communication and Technology:

- Informational Report Related to Progress on National Commission Communication Plan
- Informational Report Related to Communication and Technology Committee Progress on National Commission 2020-2025 Strategic Plan

Emerging Trends and Miscellaneous Affairs

- 2024-2028 National Commission Meeting Dates

Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Certifying Board Recognition: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission Board of Commissioners related to the Report of the Review Committee on Specialty Certifying Board Recognition:

Consideration of 2024 Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards and Final Actions: The National Commission Board of Commissioners considered the responses submitted by the recognized specialty certifying boards for the *2024 National Commission Annual Report of the Recognized Certifying Boards* and the final recognition statuses for each of the recognized certifying boards.

The Board of Commissioners noted that overall, the documentation submitted by the recognized certifying boards was accurate and the statistical data remained relatively consistent. Based on review of the documentation, the Board of Commissioners took the following actions:

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners grants the American Board of Dental Public Health the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Endodontics the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Pathology the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Oral Medicine the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Orofacial Pain the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Orthodontics the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Pediatric Dentistry the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Periodontology the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Prosthodontics the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Dental Board of Anesthesiology the continued status of Recognition.

The National Commission Board of Commissioners further grants the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Radiology the continued status of Recognition, *with reporting requirements*.

2024 Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards Final Report

The National Commission Board of Commissioners discussed the *2024 Annual Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards* and determined the report was accurate.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopts the *2024 Report of the Recognized Dental Specialty Certifying Boards* final report.

Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition: Below is the action taken by the National Commission Board of Commissioners related to the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition:

Discussion Related to National Commission Support of Subspecialty Designation Concept: The National Commission Board of Commissioners discussed continued support of the subspecialty designation concept and potential next steps.

The Board of Commissioners reviewed the timeline and discussions by the committee and Board of Commissioners related to the concept of subspecialty designation. The Board of Commissioners noted that the National Commission's original intent in developing the subspecialty criteria and policies and processes was to ensure that if subspecialty recognition was to occur in the profession, it would be done under the umbrella of the American Dental Association (ADA) and the National Commission.

In April 2023, the Board of Commissioners adopted the proposed subspecialty designation criteria and policies and processes as draft internal archived documents as an initial step in the process; however, it did not support the immediate release and use of the documentation. The National Commission needed to continue its due diligence and determine whether subspecialty designation was a viable option for the profession, whether there is a need for subspecialty designation and whether the designation of subspecialties is in the best interests of the public and the profession. Further, the Board of Commissioners established the following thresholds related to subspecialty designation:

- The National Commission will not advertise or seek applicants to ensure that the subspecialty process develops organically.
- The applicant must be a recognized dental specialty sponsoring organization who submits a written request to the National Commission.
- The subspecialty must have a Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Program.
- The Board of Commissioners will consider a written request and there must be a 2/3rds affirmative vote to release the subspecialty designation documents.

The Board of Commissioners learned that since the April 2023 Board of Commissioners meeting, discussions have occurred with the American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery and the American Board of Orthodontics. The American Board of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery currently administers a separate certification examination for those individuals who have completed a CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Program. The American Board of Orthodontics examination is scenario based, so all candidates including those who have completed a CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Program, take the same examination. The American Board of Prosthodontics is in the process of establishing a separate examination for candidates who have completed a CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Program in Maxillofacial Prosthetics.

The Board of Commissioners discussed whether the National Commission should require that a subspecialty of a recognized specialty have CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Programs. If an emerging subspecialty that is associated with a recognized specialty is allowed to develop organically based on the changing needs of the public, the requirement of having CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Programs may become a barrier for the emerging subspecialty. The Board of Commissioners learned that the requirement for a subspecialty to have CODA accredited Advanced Education Fellowship Programs is a safeguard that ensures proper advanced education and training. Further, if the Board of Commissioners makes the determination to activate the subspecialty documentation and an application is received, the application must be circulated for a 60-day public comment period among the National Commission's communities of interest as outlined in the application process. Based on the current discussion, the Board of Commissioners determined that because the subspecialty designation documents are in draft form, the documentation should be referred back to the ad hoc committee for further review and possible revision.

The Board of Commissioners learned that the committee had briefly discussed the concept of creating criteria for interest areas within the specialties similar to the Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL) *Criteria for Recognition of Interest Areas in General Dentistry*. It was determined that the creation of interest areas within the specialties may not accomplish what the subdisciplines were looking for, which is to be granted a specific designation under their recognized specialty.

The Board of Commissioners learned that during preparation for the April 2024 meeting, concerns were raised related to potential different interpretations of the *Bylaws* of the ADA as to whether the National Commission has the authority to grant subspecialty designation. The Board of Commissioners determined that prior to taking further action on the concept of subspecialty designation, the National Commission should consult with the ADA Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs (CEBJA) related to whether the National Commission has the authority to grant subspecialty designation or whether the National Commission should petition the ADA House of Delegates for a *Bylaws* revision. The National Commission should further consult and seek possible support from CDEL related to the concept of subspecialty designation. After consideration of the opinions from CEBJA and CDEL, the Board of Commissioners will make a final determination on next steps.

The Board of Commissioners noted that on February 1, 2024, the National Commission office received a letter of intent to apply for subspecialty designation from the American Academy of Maxillofacial Prosthetics and a letter of support from the American College of Prosthodontists.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners directs the ad hoc Committee on Subspecialty Recognition to communicate with and consider the opinions of the ADA Council on Ethics, Bylaws and Judicial Affairs and the ADA Council on Dental Education and Licensure on the concept of subspecialty designation and further investigate the concept of requiring Commission on Dental Accreditation programmatic accreditation for subspecialty fellowship training.

Report of the Standing Committee on Finance: Below is the action taken by the National Commission Board of Commissioners related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance:

Consideration of 2024 Revised Forecast Budget: The National Commission Board of Commissioners considered the 2024 revised forecast budget.

The Board of Commissioners noted that in July 2023 when the proposed 2024 National Commission budget was approved it accounted for a one day (1) in-person meeting and included costs related to volunteer travel expenses including airfare, stipend, hotel, and meals. The 2024 budget also included a \$7,000 honorarium related to the development and facilitation of the National Commission 2025-2030 Strategic Plan. The 2024 budget proposed an overall expense increase from \$237,851 in the 2023 budget to \$250,557 for the 2024 budget, which resulted in a \$529 increase in the annual fee for each of the recognized dental specialty sponsoring organizations from \$9,910 (budgeted for 2023) to \$10,439.

In October 2023, the ADA House of Delegates adopted an increase in the volunteer stipend from \$75 per day to \$158 per day, which created a \$5,000 deficit in the National Commission's 2024 budget. As the April 2024 in-person meeting of the Board of Commissioners was being planned, there were further increases in expenses identified related to airfare, hotel, and meals. Based on the increases in expenses, the 2024 annual fee of the recognized specialty sponsoring organizations would have increased from \$10,439 to \$10,818 per organization.

The Board of Commissioners noted that the proposed 2024 revised forecast budget included expenses for conducting a hybrid meeting in April 2024, attendance of the National Commission Chair, Vice-Chair and staff at the Summer 2024 recognized certifying board meeting and attendance of the National Commission Chair at the ADA House of Delegates meeting in October 2024. Further, the 2024 revised forecast budget proposes an overall expense decrease from \$250,557 in the 2024 budget to \$245,576 for the 2024 revised forecast budget. Based on the revised forecast, the decrease in expenses resulted in a \$207 decrease in the annual fee for each of the recognized dental specialty sponsoring organizations from \$10,439 to \$10,232.

The Board of Commissioners learned that currently the agenda for the April 2025 Board of Commissioners meeting could be accomplished in less than four (4) hours; therefore, the Board of Commissioners should consider a holding a virtual meeting. The Board of Commissioners discussed that while it is important to remain fiscally responsible, in-person meetings allow for more personal interactions among the Commissioners. At the June 2024 virtual meeting, the Board of Commissioners will be presented with two (2) proposed budgets for 2025, with one (1) budget reflecting the costs associated with convening a virtual meeting in 2025 and one (1) budget reflecting the costs associated with convening an in-person meeting.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopts the 2024 revised forecast budget.

Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review: Below are the actions taken by the National Commission Board of Commissioners related to the Report of the Standing Committee on Strategic Planning and Policy Review:

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to the Policy and Procedure Manual of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards: The National Commission Board of Commissioners considered proposed revisions to Section I: Introduction and General Information, Section II: Board of Commissioners and Review Committees of the National Commission and Section III: General National Commission Policies and Procedures of the National Commission Policy and Procedure Manual.

Purpose of this Manual

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity.

History of the National Commission on Recognition of Dental Specialties and Certifying Boards

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity.

National Commission Mission, Vision, and Values

In previous version of the National Commission Policy and Procedure Manual, the National Commission's Mission, Vision, and Values were omitted; therefore, this proposed revision is adding the Mission, Vision and Values to the Policy and Procedure Manual and making it item C in the section of the manual.

Policy on Development of Administrative and Operational Policies

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy. Due to the addition of the National Commission Mission, Vision and Values, this policy had been changed to item D.

Policy on National Commission and Commission Meetings

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy and adds language related to eligibility criteria for general dentist and specialist Commissioners.

Policy on Nomination of Public Members

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy.

Policy on Review Committees and Review Committee Meetings

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy.

Policy on National Commission Standing Committees

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy and further lists the committees in alphabetical order.

Policy on Removal of National Commission Board of Commissioners and Appeal Board

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy.

Policy on Appointment of Commissioners and Appeal Board Members If Appointing Organization Fails to Appoint Due to a Vacancy

The proposed revisions were editorial in nature to provide greater clarity to the policy.

Policy on Confidentiality

The proposed revisions add language to include all ad hoc and standing committee meeting materials and discussions. Further, language was added clarifying that all meetings related to National Commission operations are confidential and conducted in closed session.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopts the revised policies in Section I: Introduction and General Information, Section II: Board of Commissioners and Review Committees of the National Commission and Section III: General National Commission Policies and Procedures of the National Commission Policy and Procedure Manual.

Consideration of Proposed Policy Related to Progress Reports and Guidelines for Preparation of a

Progress Report: The National Commission Board of Commissioners considered proposed new policy related to Progress Reports and Guidelines for Preparation of a Progress Report.

The Board of Commissioners noted that the National Commission does not have formal policy related to progress reports and does not have a guideline template related to the preparation of progress reports to ensure proper formatting and content. A standardized format for the submission of progress reports should aid in the National Commission with receiving clear and concise responses.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopts the proposed new policy on Progress Reports and Guidelines for Preparing a Progress Report.

Consideration of National Commission 2025-2030 Strategic Plan, Action Plan and Dashboard: The National Commission Board of Commissioners considered the draft National Commission 2025-2030 Strategic Plan.

The Board of Commissioners learned that when the 2020-2025 National Commission Strategic Plan was being developed in 2019, the National Commission had only been operational since May of 2018; therefore, the goals and objectives of the 2020-2025 Strategic Plan were directed internally and focused on developing a communication plan, compliance techniques, identifying new trends in specialty recognition, improving the policies and procedures of the National Commission, investigating ways to generate revenue and utilizing the resources of the American Dental Association (ADA) to sustain the National Commission in the future.

2025-2030 Strategic Planning SWOT Analysis and Scenarios Summaries

In January 2024, the current Board of Commissioners, and the former Commissioners whose terms expired in October 2023 completed the Strategic Planning scenarios and SWOT Analysis. Seventeen (17) of thirty-one (31) Commissioners completed the scenarios and twenty (20) of thirty-one (31) Commissioners completed the SWOT Analysis.

It was noted that one of the internal strengths of the National Commission is its ability to collaborate and share ideas among experienced and dedicated volunteers. While communication outside of the National Commission was mentioned, it was not listed among its strengths. To maintain future relevance in protecting the public and improving collaboration and problem-solving among the recognized specialty sponsoring organizations and certifying boards, improving communication outside of the National Commission should be a specific goal in the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan.

Since its establishment, the National Commission has remained a politically neutral Commission and it is important that the National Commission continue to be politically neutral. Concerns were expressed related to whether the American Dental Association (ADA) House of Delegates and the ADA communities of interest understand the arms-length, semi-autonomous relationship that the four (4) Commission's housed within the ADA have with the organization. Based on these concerns, it was determined that in the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan, the National Commission should develop a strategy that emphasizes the importance of the arms-length relationship with the ADA.

The financial position of the National Commission is a weakness due to the narrow *Bylaws* duties that were established by the ADA House of Delegates. Concerns were expressed related to the continued increase in expenses outside of the National Commission's control that could generate a perceived lack of return on investment for those organizations that financially support the National Commission and eventually create a situation where financially supporting the National Commission becomes a burden. Based on these concerns, the expansion of additional revenue streams to offset expenses should be investigated; however, this would need to be thoroughly and carefully vetted to ensure there are no competing interests. Further, the National Commission should renegotiate the formula utilized in determining the National Commission's Shared Services Agreement with the ADA.

There were concerns related to the certification process of fellows/diplomates in dental organizations that are not recognized by the National Commission as it relates to public safety because the standard for certification may not be as rigorous as the standards implemented by the National Commission. The best way for the National Commission to combat these concerns is to educate itself by researching the certification processes of these organizations to better understand the processes and assist the public in understanding the importance of accredited advanced education programs and the certification processes of the recognized specialty certifying boards.

2025-2030 Strategic Plan Potential Goals and Objectives

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the potential goals and objectives of the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan include the following:

- National Commission Brand and Communication
- Credentialing of Commissioners and Succession Plan for Commission Director
- Financial Stability
- Expansion of National Commission *Bylaws* and Duties
- Education and continued protection of the public

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the National Commission 2025-2030 Strategic Plan should include patients and not just the public as a community of interest. Further, concerns were expressed that based on the individualized state dental practice acts, the definition of a dental specialty can vary significantly. The Board of Commissioners determined that it is the responsibility of the National Commission to lead the discussions related to educating patients, the public and the state licensure boards on the definition of a dental specialty.

The Board of Commissioners discussed that the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan is very ambitious. The 2025-2030 Strategic Plan will require revisions to the National Commission Communication Plan and as part of the revised plan, the National Commission may want to consider how to provide information to patients and the public. Further, it will be important to assist the National Commission's communities of interest in understanding the high thresholds for specialty sponsoring organization and certifying board recognition that are in place and that organizations should aspire to achieving recognition by the National Commission.

The Board of Commissioners discussed the proposed goal and objectives related to seeking oversight of the *Requirements for Recognition of Dental Specialties and National Certifying Board for Dental Specialists* by 2030. The Board of Commissioners discussed concerns that seeking oversight of the *Requirements for Recognition* could be perceived as a power grab by the National Commission and could potentially have a negative impact on the negotiations that occurred when the National Commission was being established in 2017. The Board of Commissioners discussed that the National Commission gaining oversight of the *Requirements for Recognition* is about addressing real and perceived conflicts of interest. The establishment of the National Commission was to eliminate real and perceived conflicts of interest by removing the authority to recognize the dental specialties from a political body to a politically neutral body. Further, while the Board of Commissioners understand that checks and balances are important; however, by 2030 CDEL and the ADA House of Delegates will not have been involved in specialty recognition matters for thirteen (13) years.

The Board of Commissioners learned that the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan Action Plan and Dashboard will be presented to the Board of Commissioners for final adoption at its June 2024 virtual meeting.

Commission Action: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adopts the proposed National Commission 2025-2030 Strategic Plan.

Report on Emerging Trends and Miscellaneous Affairs: Below are informational discussions by the National Commission Board of Commissioners related to miscellaneous affairs.

Future Meeting Dates: The National Commission Board of Commissioners reviewed the Board of Commissioners meeting dates for 2024, 2025, 2026, 2027 and 2028.

The Board of Commissioners noted that during its June 2024, virtual meeting, the Board of Commissioners will be considering the National Commission 2025 Budget, the 2025-2030 Strategic Plan Action Plan and Dashboard and electing the next Vice-chair of the Board of Commissioners. Further, the Board of Commissioners learned about the National Commission's process related to electing the Vice-chair.

Recognition of Commissioners whose Terms Expire in October 2024: The following Commissioners were recognized by the Board of Commissioners for their service to the National Commission:

- Dr. Jeff Chaffin
- Dr. Alan Felsenfeld
- Dr. Gayle Glenn
- Dr. David Halpern
- Dr. Michael Huber
- Dr. Maureen Lang
- Dr. Prabu Raman
- Dr. Brenda Young

Adjournment: The National Commission Board of Commissioners adjourned at 11:51 am central standard time, Monday, April 15, 2024.